

# Technical Comments

---

*TECHNICAL COMMENTS are brief discussions of papers previously published in this journal. They should not exceed 1500 words (where a figure or table counts as 200 words). The author of the previous paper is invited to submit a reply for publication in the same issue as the Technical Comment. These discussions are published as quickly as possible after receipt of the manuscripts. Neither AIAA nor its Editors are responsible for the opinions expressed by the authors.*

## Reply by the Authors to P. Sengupta

Darren J. Zanon\* and Mark E. Campbell†  
Cornell University, Ithaca, New York 14853

DOI: 10.2514/1.26310

Sengupta [1] presents an approach to finding closed form solutions to two integrals in a paper by Zanon and Campbell [2]. There are two pertinent comments to this technical note. First, the two integrals in [2] can indeed be solved in closed form using an approach that is similar to that described in [1]. The authors have used these closed form integrals in their most recent work [3]. Second, in terms of their usefulness to the algorithm presented in [2], the formation planning theory is not altered and, computationally, the differences are minimal because of the speed of current spline functions. But, the closed form integrals of [1] nicely complete the optimal control problem setup of [2].

Whereas closed form integrals are solvable for thrust effects from constant or bang–bang control such as those in [2], the use of spline functions in the input control matrices is enabling for the more general case when the control is time varying. A good example of this is when a spacecraft and control thrusters are rotating in the relative reference frame, and the problem requires attitude dynamics or attitude constraints. This case is addressed in [3].

## References

- [1] Sengupta, P., “Comment on ‘Optimal Planner for Spacecraft Formations in Elliptical Orbits’,” submitted to *Journal of Guidance, Control, and Dynamics*, Vol. 29, No. 6, 2006, pp. XXXX.
- [2] Zanon, D., and Campbell, M., “Optimal Planner for Spacecraft Formations in Elliptical Orbits,” *Journal of Guidance, Control, and Dynamics*, Vol. 29, No. 1, 2006, pp. 161–171.
- [3] Zanon, D., and Campbell, M., “Spacecraft Formation Fuel Optimal Maneuvers with Attitude Constraints,” AIAA Paper 2006-6588, 2006.

---

Received 3 July 2006; accepted for publication 3 July 2006. Copyright © 2006 by Darren Zanon and Mark Campbell. Published by the American Institute of Aeronautics and Astronautics, Inc., with permission. Copies of this paper may be made for personal or internal use, on condition that the copier pay the \$10.00 per-copy fee to the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923; include the code 10.2514/1.26310 in correspondence with the CCC.

\*Graduate Student, Aerospace Engineering, Cornell University.

†Professor, Cornell University. Senior Member AIAA.